

EXHIBIT G

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS
EASTERN DIVISION

MIKE HARRIS and JEFF DUNSTAN,)	
individually and on behalf of a)	
class of similarly situated)	
individuals,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	
)	
-vs-)	No. 1:11-cv-5807
)	
COMSCORE, INC., a Delaware)	Judge Holderman
corporation,)	
)	Magistrate Judge
)	Kim
Defendant.)	
)	

The deposition of ROBERTO TAMASSIA, Ph.D., called by the Plaintiffs for examination, pursuant to notice and pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure for the United States District Courts pertaining to the taking of depositions, taken before Emily R. Pellegrino, Certified Shorthand Reporter and Notary Public within and for the County of Cook and State of Illinois, at 350 North LaSalle Street, 13th Floor, Chicago, Illinois, commencing at the hour of 9:29 a.m. on the 14th day of December, A.D., 2012.

A P P E A R A N C E S:

EDELSON MCGUIRE, LLC, By
MR. CHANDLER GIVENS and
MR. BEN THOMASSEN
350 North LaSalle Street, 13th Floor
(312) 589-6370
(312) 589-6378 (Facsimile)
cgivens@edelson.com
bthomassen@edelson.com

On behalf of the Plaintiffs;

QUINN, EMANUEL, URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP, By
MR. STEPHEN A. SWEDLOW and
MS. ROBYN M. BOWLAND
500 West Madison Street, Suite 2450
Chicago, Illinois 60661
(312) 705-7400
(312) 705-7401 (Facsimile)
stephenswedlow@quinnemanuel.com
robynbowland@quinnemanuel.com

and

STACK & O'CONNOR, Chtd., By
MR. PAUL F. STACK
140 South Dearborn Street, Suite 411
Chicago, Illinois 60603
(312) 782-0690
(312) 782-0936 (Facsimile)
pstack@stacklaw.com

and

MR. THOMAS S. CUSHING, III
11950 Democracy Drive, Suite 600
Reston, Virginia, 20190
(703) 438-2392
(703) 438-2350 (Facsimile)
tcushing@comscore.com

On behalf of the Defendant.
ALSO PRESENT:

Mr. Amir Missaghi

(Witness duly sworn.)

ROBERTO TAMASSIA, Ph.D.,

called as a witness herein, having been first duly
sworn, was examined and testified as follows:

EXAMINATION

BY MR. GIVENS:

Q. Good morning, Roberto.

A. Hi.

Q. My name is Chandler Givens, this is my
colleague Ben Thomassen, and one of our law clerks
Amir Missaghi who's sitting in today.

A. Okay.

Q. I read in your expert report that you
haven't testified at deposition or trial in the past
four yours. Have you ever sat for a deposition
before?

A. I have never sat for a deposition.

Q. Okay. So I'm going to layout some ground
rules just to help you understand what's going on
here.

A. Sure.

Q. Everything you say is on the record today,
so I need you to give verbal answers. So if you nod
your head or shrug your shoulders or point a finger

I N D E X

WITNESS EXAMINATION

ROBERTO TAMASSIA, Ph.D.

By Mr. Givens 4

E X H I B I T S

TAMASSIA
DEPOSITION EXHIBIT MARKED FOR ID

No. 1	4
No. 2	76
No. 3	79
No. 4	81
No. 5	83

at me, she's not going to be able to pick this up.

A. Okay.

Q. So that's one. The second thing is if you
don't understand one of the questions that I'm asking
you, just ask for a clarification, that's fine. But
if you don't, then I'm going to assume you understand
the question. Your counsel Stephen might object, but
you are required to answer unless he instructs you
otherwise.

Are you on any medications, substances, or
do you have any health issues that might prevent you
from understanding the questions that I'm going to
ask you today and responding?

A. No.

(Whereupon, Tamassia Deposition
Exhibit No. 1 was marked for
identification, ERP.)

BY MR. GIVENS:

Q. Let's begin here. I'm handing you what has
been marked as Tamassia Exhibit 1 which is your
expert report. You'll be familiar with it.

A. Yes.

Q. Do you recognize this document?

A. Yes. Right.

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 42</p> <p>1 MR. SWEDLOW: Objection, vague.</p> <p>2 You can answer.</p> <p>3 THE WITNESS: I would like to speak about</p> <p>4 the computer user that is identified in the ULA.</p> <p>5 Installation process requires the users to be an</p> <p>6 administrator of the ULA. Administrator with</p> <p>7 computer has knowledge about installation of programs</p> <p>8 and installation of program settings. I believe that</p> <p>9 a user who's an administrator of a computer should be</p> <p>10 able to understand exactly what is the meaning of, so</p> <p>11 what is the operation of the software.</p> <p>12 BY MR. GIVENS:</p> <p>13 Q. So a general user then?</p> <p>14 A. A general user who is an administrator.</p> <p>15 Q. What do you mean by administrator?</p> <p>16 A. Administrator is a user who has certain</p> <p>17 privilege rights with respect to installing programs,</p> <p>18 reviewing programs, and viewing and modifying</p> <p>19 settings on a computer.</p> <p>20 Q. Give me an example of an administrator.</p> <p>21 A. I'm not sure I understand the question when</p> <p>22 you say example of administrator. I am an example of</p> <p>23 an administrator, for example. I don't know if that</p> <p>24 is your question.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 44</p> <p>1 software was installed?</p> <p>2 MR. SWEDLOW: Can you read that question</p> <p>3 back because I wasn't paying attention?</p> <p>4 (Whereupon, the record was</p> <p>5 read as requested.)</p> <p>6 MR. SWEDLOW: I'll object as vague. There</p> <p>7 is no "no." Do you want to rephrase that question?</p> <p>8 MR. GIVENS: I don't want to rephrase the</p> <p>9 question.</p> <p>10 MR. SWEDLOW: It doesn't make any sense</p> <p>11 then.</p> <p>12 THE WITNESS: Can I ask clarification of the</p> <p>13 meaning by what happens? What do you mean by what</p> <p>14 happens?</p> <p>15 BY MR. GIVENS:</p> <p>16 Q. In your report you write, if a user selects</p> <p>17 "no" when presented with a dialog box requesting</p> <p>18 acceptance of the disclosures and ULA, the comScore</p> <p>19 installation process does not run. During the</p> <p>20 demonstration, did Yvonne Bigbee click no?</p> <p>21 A. Now I can answer your question? Okay. I</p> <p>22 asked to see both what happens when the user agrees</p> <p>23 and accepts and when the user disagrees and does not</p> <p>24 accept, and I saw in the administration that when the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 43</p> <p>1 Q. Can any consumer be an administrator on</p> <p>2 their computer?</p> <p>3 A. Are you asking whether any person or -- what</p> <p>4 do you mean by consumer here?</p> <p>5 Q. Any person, yes.</p> <p>6 A. Okay. So not every person on this planet</p> <p>7 will have the basic understanding of how a computer</p> <p>8 works to be an administrator. So there is some basic</p> <p>9 computer skills that are needed in order to be an</p> <p>10 administrator. Do you want me to elaborate more on</p> <p>11 this?</p> <p>12 Q. I'd love for you to elaborate a little bit.</p> <p>13 A. Well, what I can say is that computer</p> <p>14 literacy is growing worldwide, especially in the</p> <p>15 United States, and so a good fraction of the</p> <p>16 population is likely to have skills of computer</p> <p>17 administrator.</p> <p>18 Q. Is every user who installs comScore software</p> <p>19 an administrator?</p> <p>20 A. Yes. The software is set up so that if the</p> <p>21 user logged into the machine is not an administrator,</p> <p>22 then the installation will not proceed.</p> <p>23 Q. What happened during the demonstration when</p> <p>24 Yvonne clicked no when she was showing you how the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 45</p> <p>1 user does not accept does not agree, the comScore</p> <p>2 portion of the software is not installed but the user</p> <p>3 will still be able to install the other software that</p> <p>4 was bundled together with the comScore software which</p> <p>5 was the original software that the user attempted to</p> <p>6 download.</p> <p>7 Q. During the demonstration, was there only one</p> <p>8 type of bundled software used?</p> <p>9 A. Yes. In the demonstration, there was only</p> <p>10 one type of bundled software.</p> <p>11 Q. Let's move to the operation section of your</p> <p>12 report.</p> <p>13 A. Yes.</p> <p>14 Q. The basis for this whole section is the</p> <p>15 demonstration that was given to you at Reston,</p> <p>16 Virginia; is that correct?</p> <p>17 A. Yes.</p> <p>18 Q. Can you explain a few ways that a panelist</p> <p>19 will be able to determine that comScore software is</p> <p>20 running on their computer?</p> <p>21 A. Are you referring with the word "panelist"</p> <p>22 to a user who has installed the comScore software?</p> <p>23 Q. Yes.</p> <p>24 A. There are various reasons, multiple reasons</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 46</p> <p>1 that will make such -- panelist as copious user to be 2 fully aware that the software is fine. So first of 3 all, this panelist has explicitly accepted the 4 installation such that manner is occurring. Second, 5 the panelist should notice that the tray area of the 6 task bar in the Windows operating system contains an 7 icon associated with the comScore software. This 8 provides an explicit and continuous and persistent 9 indication that the software is running. In 10 addition, whenever the user -- this panelist, this 11 user will look at the list of programs installed, 12 that the software will appear.</p> <p>13 And then even more, if you look at what is 14 called the task manager, which is a display of the 15 so-called processes, programs running, the comScore 16 software is there. And if one will inspect some 17 settings of the machine or the so called registry, 18 one will see registry keys associated with the 19 software. The primary visual indication is in the 20 system, is in the tray.</p> <p>21 Q. In the second sentence of the last full 22 paragraph on page four "Uninstallation" you write, 23 based upon my observations of the demonstration and 24 the documentation I reviewed, comScore software can</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 48</p> <p>1 additionally through the start menu.</p> <p>2 Q. What methods do you use to verify that all 3 components of the comScore software have been removed 4 from the machine?</p> <p>5 A. I asked to show me the locations within the 6 file system and within the registry where traces of 7 the installation would have been present if it were 8 not complete. And through the inspection, so I asked 9 Yvonne who showed me the registry to show me certain 10 folders on the computer, and there were no files that 11 indicated that the program still existed.</p> <p>12 In addition, I asked about various details 13 of the operation of the software. And based on what 14 I was told, it is my opinion that no files associated 15 with the tracking were left in the file system. 16 There was a portion of my report where I mentioned 17 that the filtering and trackings performed in 18 internal memory, so there is kind of no log files, no 19 log files that will be part of the file system.</p> <p>20 Q. But you never personally checked the 21 computer; you relied upon Yvonne Bigbee's 22 demonstration?</p> <p>23 A. The screen of the computer was projected in 24 front of me and Yvonne did exactly what I asked her</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 47</p> <p>1 be uninstalled in manner consistent with other 2 Windows based software, and you go on to write, 3 through the add/remove function provided as a part of 4 the Windows operating system.</p> <p>5 Can you explain your basis for writing in a 6 manner consistent with other Windows based software?</p> <p>7 A. The Windows operating system includes 8 specifications for developers of applications on how 9 uninstallation should be performed. All applications 10 for the Windows operating system are expected to 11 provide an uninstallation program. And this 12 uninstallation program is the one that will be 13 launched when the user goes to this app within the 14 settings of the computer, called in operation Windows 15 add/remove programs and enter other things. So it is 16 the standard expected way. All applications are 17 expected to provide this functionality.</p> <p>18 Q. In your experience, have you seen consumer 19 software that adds an item to a user start menu that 20 is an icon to uninstall software; are you familiar 21 with that?</p> <p>22 A. I am perfectly familiar with what you're 23 saying and, yes, I have seen some software 24 applications that provide the uninstall functionality</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 49</p> <p>1 to do. So I considered this equivalent to myself 2 having inspected the files. Unless, of course, some 3 trick was set up to show me something else.</p> <p>4 Q. What tool did you use to use the registry?</p> <p>5 A. I asked Yvonne to show me the registry and 6 she used a standard tool called reg edit.</p> <p>7 MR. SWEDLOW: A what?</p> <p>8 THE WITNESS: Reg edit, R-e-g, e-d-i-t.</p> <p>9 BY MR. GIVENS:</p> <p>10 Q. Backing up for just a second on the same 11 page the third full paragraph from the bottom last 12 sentence you write, moreover, every user who provides 13 his or her e-mail address during installation of 14 comScore software, it sends an e-mail that includes 15 the ULA. What's your basis for that sentence?</p> <p>16 A. The question I asked and the answer I 17 obtained.</p> <p>18 Q. Okay. Let's move to the obfuscation 19 section. Can you explain to me what regular 20 expressions are?</p> <p>21 A. Regular expression is a standard mechanism 22 for describing in a succinct way a collection of text 23 strings. Text string is a sequence of characters. 24 Regular expression can by informally viewed as text</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 50</p> <p>1 pattern. For example, a regular expression will</p> <p>2 describe succinctly the form of a Social Security</p> <p>3 number, of a phone number, of a ZIP code, of a</p> <p>4 two-digit abbreviation of a state. That's it.</p> <p>5 Q. When you write that the software uses a</p> <p>6 computational technique called regular expressions to</p> <p>7 check for the presence of text patterns associated</p> <p>8 with sensitive data, who determines what those text</p> <p>9 patterns are?</p> <p>10 MR. SWEDLOW: In the report? Objection,</p> <p>11 vague.</p> <p>12 THE WITNESS: Yeah, I actually do not</p> <p>13 understand your question about who determines.</p> <p>14 BY MR. GIVENS:</p> <p>15 Q. Let me ask generally. If you're using</p> <p>16 regular expressions to detect the presence of text</p> <p>17 pattern, who is that determines the text pattern; is</p> <p>18 it the programmer?</p> <p>19 A. The process for creating the regular</p> <p>20 expression should be based on domain knowledge about</p> <p>21 how the text patterns look like and then the</p> <p>22 programmer will now implement this domain knowledge</p> <p>23 in the specific program language for the regular</p> <p>24 expressions. So someone, for example, who knows</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 52</p> <p>1 once they are discovered, the software either removes</p> <p>2 completely the data or transforms it so that the new</p> <p>3 output data cannot be used to reconstruct the</p> <p>4 original data.</p> <p>5 Q. When you say removes completely, what do you</p> <p>6 mean?</p> <p>7 A. Removes completely means that the output of</p> <p>8 the transformation is the empty data set.</p> <p>9 Q. Is the empty data set then sent to</p> <p>10 comScore's servers?</p> <p>11 A. There is no such concept of submitting an</p> <p>12 empty set. The data is suppressed, is not uploaded.</p> <p>13 Q. Once that type of sensitive information is</p> <p>14 detected, a credit card number, a Social Security</p> <p>15 number, a bank number, would it be technically</p> <p>16 feasible to simply excise that information or not</p> <p>17 collect it at all?</p> <p>18 MR. SWEDLOW: I'll object as vague and</p> <p>19 compound, but you can answer.</p> <p>20 THE WITNESS: Your question, it is</p> <p>21 hypothetical about -- so can you rephrase it again?</p> <p>22 Can you say it to me again so I can understand?</p> <p>23 BY MR. GIVENS:</p> <p>24 Q. My understanding of the way the comScore</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 51</p> <p>1 about the form of the Social Security numbers will</p> <p>2 determine how the pattern looks like. And then the</p> <p>3 programmer will have to create what is the actual</p> <p>4 programming specification of the regular expression.</p> <p>5 Q. So at comScore, who is the person who</p> <p>6 determines that?</p> <p>7 A. I did not ask who is the person. I assumed</p> <p>8 that they have domain experts who have this knowledge</p> <p>9 and I know that it is the software developers under</p> <p>10 the leadership of the CDO and the director of</p> <p>11 technology and video technology who implement in this</p> <p>12 programming language of regular expressions what is</p> <p>13 this domain knowledge.</p> <p>14 Q. When you write in your report that sensitive</p> <p>15 data is transformed through the obfuscation process,</p> <p>16 what do you mean by transformed?</p> <p>17 A. What I mean is that there is a matter that</p> <p>18 takes as input data and could use as output some</p> <p>19 other data; that is the transformation process.</p> <p>20 Q. So is the comScore software actively seeking</p> <p>21 Social Security numbers, credit card numbers?</p> <p>22 A. Yes. The software tries to identify the</p> <p>23 presence of various types of sensitive data including</p> <p>24 Social Security numbers and credit card numbers. And</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 53</p> <p>1 software works is that it uses regular expressions to</p> <p>2 detect some certain information like a credit card or</p> <p>3 Social Security number?</p> <p>4 A. Yes.</p> <p>5 Q. Then it collects that information and</p> <p>6 transforms it; those are your words?</p> <p>7 A. Yes.</p> <p>8 Q. Would it be technically feasible to rather</p> <p>9 than collect it and transform it, to detect it, and</p> <p>10 not collect it at all?</p> <p>11 A. Of course it is technically feasible to do</p> <p>12 nothing about the information that is collected, but</p> <p>13 comScore is in the business of actually acquiring</p> <p>14 some type of information.</p> <p>15 Q. Why do you think comScore transforms credit</p> <p>16 card numbers and collects that information?</p> <p>17 A. You're asking two questions. Can you ask</p> <p>18 them separately?</p> <p>19 Q. Why do you think that comScore actively</p> <p>20 seeks credit card numbers to collect?</p> <p>21 A. Yes. My understanding of the comScore</p> <p>22 business is that they're the one to provide aggregate</p> <p>23 statistical data to their customers about, for</p> <p>24 example, the use of certain credit cards for</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 54</p> <p>1 transactions. So that's one of the reasons that they</p> <p>2 will track credit card usage across the economy,</p> <p>3 across the users of the software.</p> <p>4 Q. Once the comScore software is installed on</p> <p>5 the user's machine, is it constantly listening for</p> <p>6 web traffic?</p> <p>7 A. My understanding is that yes, this is the</p> <p>8 case.</p> <p>9 Q. When the comScore software detects</p> <p>10 information to be collected, how much time elapses</p> <p>11 between collection and transmission to comScore</p> <p>12 servers?</p> <p>13 A. I did not run timing experiments, so I</p> <p>14 cannot answer this question.</p> <p>15 Q. When you write in your expert report --</p> <p>16 MR. SWEDLOW: Are we on page five?</p> <p>17 BY MR. GIVENS:</p> <p>18 Q. Page five second full paragraph, once it is</p> <p>19 identified sensitive data is transformed by an</p> <p>20 obfuscation process, it aims to remove detailed</p> <p>21 information while preserving more general information</p> <p>22 of statistical significance. What do you mean by</p> <p>23 general information of statistical significance?</p> <p>24 A. General information means that this</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 56</p> <p>1 difficult to have absolute certainty of the success</p> <p>2 of a certain program. In particular, it is</p> <p>3 unfeasible to try the program on all possible inputs.</p> <p>4 However, my reading of the software, the description</p> <p>5 I was given of the techniques and methods indicates</p> <p>6 that the obfuscation process is based on technically</p> <p>7 sound principals and was implemented with the</p> <p>8 appropriate tools.</p> <p>9 Q. Look with me now at the last sentence of the</p> <p>10 second full paragraph --</p> <p>11 A. Uh-huh.</p> <p>12 Q. -- where you write, in addition, the</p> <p>13 technique of cryptographic hashing is used to map</p> <p>14 other sensitive data items to numeric values called</p> <p>15 digests that have the following properties: (1) with</p> <p>16 very high probability, the digests are uniquely</p> <p>17 associated with the items; (2) it is computationally</p> <p>18 infeasible to reconstruct the items form the digest.</p> <p>19 What do you mean when you write it is</p> <p>20 computationally infeasible to reconstruct the items</p> <p>21 from the digest?</p> <p>22 A. The meaning is that reversing the</p> <p>23 transformation is practically impossible to do given</p> <p>24 current computer technology.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 55</p> <p>1 information about class of objects, a class of items.</p> <p>2 For example, the class of days of birth that have the</p> <p>3 same year or the class of credit card numbers that</p> <p>4 start with the same seven digits. This is not</p> <p>5 information about a specific credit card of the user.</p> <p>6 It is a class of credit cards that include the credit</p> <p>7 card of the user. That's the meaning of general</p> <p>8 information.</p> <p>9 The meaning of statistical significance</p> <p>10 means that it is relevant to the type of statistical</p> <p>11 summaries that are provided by the comScore to their</p> <p>12 customers; for example, demographic information as</p> <p>13 related to certain types of internet shopping habits</p> <p>14 or user job certain brands of credit cards for</p> <p>15 certain types of internet transactions.</p> <p>16 Q. When you write since the data's transformed</p> <p>17 by an obfuscation process that aims to remove</p> <p>18 detailed information, why did you write aims to</p> <p>19 remove rather than remove? Let me rephrase that.</p> <p>20 Are you aware of any instances where the</p> <p>21 software doesn't remove the detailed information?</p> <p>22 A. The reason why I wrote the sentence with the</p> <p>23 term aims is because it is the clear intent of the</p> <p>24 code. And as in any programming endeavors, it is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 57</p> <p>1 Q. Would it be computationally feasible to</p> <p>2 reconstruct the items from the digest if you were</p> <p>3 aware of what the values associated with the digest</p> <p>4 were?</p> <p>5 A. The question you are asking seems to be of</p> <p>6 the type if you already know what the value is, can</p> <p>7 you reconstruct the value from the digest. There is</p> <p>8 no point in reconstructing something that you already</p> <p>9 know.</p> <p>10 Q. Are you familiar with the concept of rainbow</p> <p>11 tables?</p> <p>12 A. Yes.</p> <p>13 Q. So here you write, it's computationally</p> <p>14 infeasible to reconstruct the items from the digest.</p> <p>15 But comScore not only has the digest; they also have</p> <p>16 the associated value, i.e., this is a Social Security</p> <p>17 number; is that correct?</p> <p>18 A. ComScore detects -- attempts to detect the</p> <p>19 presence of Social Security numbers through regular</p> <p>20 expressions, then Social Security numbers are</p> <p>21 suppressed, so the transformation actually produces</p> <p>22 no output value; it produces the empty data set. For</p> <p>23 Social Security numbers, they do not use the</p> <p>24 technique of cryptographic hashing.</p>